

SELECTION OF ONE FULL PROFESSOR (PROFESSORE ORDINARIO), FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 12/E2 COMPARATIVE LAW – ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE IUS/21 COMPARATIVE PUBLIC LAW (SETTORE CONCORSUALE 12/E2 DIRITTO COMPARATO – SETTORE SCIENTIFICO DISCIPLINARE IUS/21 DIRITTO PUBBLICO COMPARATO) AT THE DIRPOLIS INSTITUTE - ACADEMIC CLASS OF SOCIAL SCIENCES, RESERVED, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 6, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, FOR ASSOCIATE PROFESSORS AND RESEARCHERS EMPLOYED AT THE SCHOOL, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 452 DATED 16/07/2020.

MINUTES OF THE PRELIMINARY MEETING

The Review Committee for the selection of one Full Professor for the Academic Recruitment Field 12/E2 Comparative Law – Academic Discipline IUS/21 Comparative Public Law at the DIRPOLIS Institute of the Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari e di Perfezionamento Sant'Anna di Pisa reserved for associate professors and researchers employed at the School to be selected pursuant to art. 24, subsection 6 of the Italian law 240/2010, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 557 dated 28/09/2020, consists of:

- Prof. Josep Maria Castellà Andreu, Full Professor at the University of Barcelona;
- Prof. Piero Castoldi, Full Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 09/F2 “Telecommunications” at the Scuola Superiore Sant’Anna, Member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Susanna Mancini, Full Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 12/E2 Comparative Law at the University of Bologna;
- Prof. Francesco Palermo, Full Professor of Academic Recruitment Field 12/E2 Comparative Law at the University of Verona;
- Prof. Paolo Passaglia, Full Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 12/E2 Comparative Law, at the University of Pisa, designated expert by the Dirpolis Institute;
- Prof. Marie-Claire Ponthoreau, Full Professor at the University of Bordeaux.

The committee convened for the first time, via teleconference, on 29 October 2020, at 9 am from the following locations:

Prof. Castellà Andreu located in Barcelona, connected via (means - address): Zoom

Prof. Castoldi located in Pisa, connected via (means - address): Zoom

Prof. Mancini located in Bologna, connected via (means - address): Zoom

Prof. Palermo located in Bolzano/Bozen, connected via: Zoom

Prof. Passaglia located in Pisa, connected via (means - address): Zoom

Prof. Marie-Claire Ponthoreau, located in Bordeaux, connected via (means - address): Zoom
The ID of the meeting is the following:

<https://us04web.zoom.us/j/71728486362?pwd=TDZXSDhMQmZnOFcyeDdXT253bHp6dz09>.

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by members of the Committee.

Prof. Paolo Passaglia was nominated as Chairperson and Prof. Piero Castoldi as Secretary.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that they had no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and that there were no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c.

The Committee then reviewed the call (<https://www.santannapisa.it/it/selezioni-e-concorsi/selezione-la-copertura-di-una-posizione-di-professore-di-prima-fascia-1>) as well as Regulations of the School that regard calls for level 1 and level 2 professors (Arts. 18 and 24 of Law no. 240/2010), and carried a motion that the committee's work should terminate by January 28, 2021 (*four months from the date of the nomination decree*). The Committee ascertained that Personnel Office informed that one application has been received.

The Committee agreed that the aim of the present meeting is to assess the criteria with which the publications, the curricula and teaching activities of the candidates will be evaluated and published on the School's website.

In accordance with Italian Ministerial Decree no. 344/2011, the following shall be assessed: educational activities, supplementary teaching and service to students, as well as the research activities carried out by the researcher.

The Commission will assess the candidates according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree no. 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification" for teaching and research required for access to didactic positions at the School¹, established by the Commission for recruitment, according to the following:

¹ ¹ Teaching and Research qualification criteria, specifically requested by the Sant'Anna School (decided by Recruitment Committee and approved by the Academic Senate on 15 April 2014 and modified on 20 January 2015):

Research Activity skills: the candidates must hold an outstanding ranking in their discipline in terms of quantity and quality of scientific publications; bibliometric criteria may be used if relevant for the scientific area.

Candidates must submit a document containing a self-assessment of their scientific productions in the international context. In this document they must explain their strengths by comparison with the best-known colleagues' production and highlighting their relationships and their scientific reputation in the international research networks.

Teaching Activity skills: Teaching activity in post-graduate courses, particularly in PhD programs, is requested.

Participation in research projects: candidates are required to have been involved in research projects funded through competitive calls such as European ERC grants, "Framework Programs" (eg, Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, *STReP*, etc) Marie Curie actions, as well as national funding agencies. Ability in fundraising is welcome.

Publishing activity: the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations hold by the candidates will be considered for the purpose of the selections.

1. For the assessment of teaching, supplementary teaching and service to students, the Commission will take account of:

- a) number of courses/ modules taught and continuity of teaching activities;
- b) results of official feedback from students on the modules / courses taught;
- c) coordination of teaching and/or training activities, and participation in committees on student progress/direction;
- d) quantity and quality of seminars, regarding both tutorials and mentoring of students, including activities relating to the preparation of theses for Master's degree and PhD.

2. Publications will be assessed along with texts accepted for publication in accordance with regulations as well as the essays included in collective works and articles published in journals in paper or digital format, with the exception of internal notes or departmental reports. The overall consistency of the scientific production of the researcher shall be assessed, the intensity and the temporal continuity of such production, with the exception of periods of involuntary removal from the research with particular reference to parental functions - such periods should be adequately documented.

The evaluation of scientific publications will be carried out on the basis of the following additional criteria:

- a) originality, innovation, methodological rigor and relevance of each publication;
- b) coherence of each publication with the specific profile of a university full professor of the Academic Discipline IUS/21 Comparative Public Law or with closely related interdisciplinary subjects;
- c) scientific relevance of each publication (impact factor or similar if recognized by the scientific community of reference) and his dissemination within the scientific community;
- d) analytical determination, on the basis of guidelines recognized by the relevant international scientific community of the individual contribution of the researcher in the case of works carried out in partnership;
- e) in sectors where international use is consolidated, the Commission also makes use of the following indicators, with reference to the start date of the assessment:

- 1) the total number of citations;
- 2) the average number of citations per publication;
- 3) combinations of the above parameters to increase the impact of the candidate's scientific production (Hirsch index or similar).

3. In the assessment of the scientific research, the Commission will take account of:

- a) organisation, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups or

participation therein;

b) participation as a speaker in national and international conferences;

c) national and international awards for research activities;

d) any ownership of patents.

The Commission will pay particular attention to the scientific output produced by the candidate after the date of expiry of the call under which they obtained eligibility ("Abilitazione") in order to check the continuity of their scientific production.

The Committee then establishes the criteria that it adopts for the evaluation of scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the applicant.

*More particularly, the Committee will consider the following criteria pertaining to the **research activity** of the applicants: applicants have to rank among the best scholars in their sectors with regard to the quantity and quality of their research output. Due to the specific features of the academic recruitment field 12/E2 bibliometric criteria will not apply. In doing so, the Committee will assess the significance and the quality demonstration of the applicants' self-assessments, as provided for in the announcement.*

*The Committee will consider the following criteria pertaining to the **teaching activity** of the applicants: significant teaching activity at the national and international levels as well as teaching activity in postgraduate courses, including PhD programmes, will be considered a title of merit. Proven ability to supervise final dissertations and, above all, PhD theses, will also be considered a title of merit.*

*The Committee will consider the following criteria pertaining to the **research projects**: participation in research projects funded through competitive calls for European projects such as ERC grants, Framework projects (e.g. Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, STReP, etc.), Erasmus+. Programs, Marie Curie actions, etc., or other international and national competitive projects will be considered a title of merit.*

If relevant, the applicant's proven ability to attract research funds from public and private subjects will be considered a title of merit. This ability should be assessed in relation to the different funding needs for research activities in the different disciplinary areas of the School.

*With regard to **publishing activities**, the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities, i.e. participation of the applicants in boards of scientific societies will be assessed.*

With regard to the identification of the contribution of the co-authors of the publications submitted by applicants, only the formal recognition of the authorship will be considered.

Publications written in collaboration with members of the committee will not be considered.

Prof. Castoldi opens the envelope containing the list of candidates. The list consists of one candidate: Giuseppe Martinico. Prof. Castoldi and each other member of the selection committee declare that he/she is not:

- a relative, or similar, to the fourth degree with the candidate (as per Art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948);
- in a situation of incompatibility with the candidate (as per articles 51 and 52 of the Code of Civil Procedure);
- in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidate (as per art. 6 bis of the Legislative Decree no. 241/1990).

The Committee decides to reconvene on _24 November 2020, at 2 p.m. via teleconference through Cisco Webex Meeting, <https://sssop.webex.com/meet/pcastoldi>, in order to assess the scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the candidate.

At the end of the meeting, the President will sign the minutes and will send them to the Personnel Office who will then make public the criteria and procedures for the assessment of publications and qualifications.

The attached declarations of the Committee's members will be sent the Personnel Office too.

The meeting was adjourned at 9.30.

Read, approved and signed,

The President
(Paolo Passaglia)