SELECTION OF ONE PROFESSOR (LEVEL 1 – PROFESSORE ORDINARIO), FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 06/D1 CARDIOVASCULAR AND RESPIRATORY DISEASES – ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE MED/11 CARDIOVASCULAR DISEASES (SETTORE CONCORSUALE 06/D1 MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO CARDIOVASCOLARE E MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO RESPIRATORIO – SETTORE SCIENTIFICO DISCIPLINARE MED/11 MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO CARDIOVASCOLARE) AT THE LIFE SCIENCES INSTITUTE - ACADEMIC CLASS OF SPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, RESERVED, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 6, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, FOR ASSOCIATE PROFESSORS AND RESEARCHERS EMPLOYED AT THE SCHOOL, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 130 DATED 12/03/2019.

## MINUTES OF THE PRELIMINARY MEETING

The Review Committee for the selection of one professor (level 1) for the academic recruitment field 06/D1 Cardiovascular and Respiratory Diseases – Academic Discipline MED/11 Cardiovascular Diseases" at the Institute of Life Sciences of the Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari e di Perfezionamento Sant'Anna di Pisa reserved for associate professors and researchers employed at the School to be selected pursuant to art. 24, subsection 6 of the Italian law 240/2010, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 312 dated 28/05/2019, consists of:

- Prof. Anna Loretoni, Full Professor of 14/A1 "Political Philosophy" at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Filippo Crea, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University Cattolica of Roma, designated expert by the Life Sciences Institute;
- Prof. Paolo Camici, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University San Raffaele of Milano;
- Prof. Gianfranco Sinagra, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University of Trieste;
- Prof. Shah Ajay, Full Professor at the King's College of London.
- Prof. Joseph Hill, Full Professor at the UT Southwestern.

The committee convened for the first time, via teleconference, on September 11<sup>th</sup> 2019 at 16.00 CET, from the following locations:

- Prof. Loretoni located in Pisa, connected via Skype. Address. Skype anna-loretoni
- Prof. Crea located in Roma, connected via Skype. Address: Filippo Crea
- Prof. Camici located in Milano, connected via Skype. Address Paolo Camici
- Prof. Sinagra located in Trieste, connected via via Skype. Address scuolacardiologiatrieste2017@gmail.com
- Prof. Shah located in London, connected via Skype. Address: ajayshah45
- Prof. Hill located in Houston, connected via Skype. Address: josephahill

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by members of the Committee.

Prof. Crea was nominated as Chairperson and Prof. Sinagra as Secretary.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that they had no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and that there were no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c.

The Committee then reviewed the call (published on the School website https://www.santannapisa.it/it/selezioni-e-concorsi/selezioni-la-copertura-di-tre-posizioni-di-

professore-di-prima-fascia-riservate) as well as Regulations of the School that regard calls for level 1 and level 2 professors (Arts. 18 and 24 of Law 240/2010), and acknowledged that the work should ideally be completed by September, 28, 2019 (four months from the date of the nomination decree dated May, 28, 2019). Since it appeared however difficult to find a suitable date for all Committee members for the second meeting within September 28, because of the multiple professional commitments already accepted by the members, the Committee decided since the beginning to ask the School's Rector to postpone the deadline by two additional months.

The Committee agreed that the aim of the present meeting was to assess the criteria with which the publications the curricula and teaching activities of the candidates will be evaluated and published on the School's website.

In accordance with Italian Ministerial Decree 344/2011, the following shall be assessed: educational activities, supplementary teaching and service to students, as well as the research activities carried out by the researcher.

The Commission will assess the candidates according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification" for teaching and research required for access to didactic positions at the School1<sup>1</sup>,

<sup>1</sup> Teaching and Research qualification criteria, specifically requested by the Sant'Anna School (decided by Recruitment Committee and approved by the Academic Senate on 15 April 2014 and modified on 20 January 2015):

**Research Activity skills:** the candidates must hold an outstanding ranking in their discipline in terms of quantity and quality of scientific publications; bibliometric criteria may be used if relevant for the scientific area.

Candidates must submit a document containing a self-assessment of their scientific productions in the international context. In this document they must explain their strenght by comparison with the best-known colleagues' production and highlighting their relationships and their scientific reputation in the international research networks.

**Teaching Activity skills:** Teaching activity in post-graduate courses, particularly in PhD programs, is requested.

**Participation in research projects**: candidates are required to have been involved in research projects funded through competitive calls e.g. European ERC grants, "Framework Programs" (eg, Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, *STReP*, etc) Marie Curie actions, as well as national funding agencies. Ability in fundraising is welcome.

**Publishing activity**: the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations hold by the candidates will be considered for the purpose of the selections.

established by the Commission for recruitment, according to the following:

- 1. For the assessment of teaching, supplementary teaching and service to students, the Commission will take account of:
- a) number of courses/ modules taught and continuity of teaching activities;
- b) Results of official feedback from students on the modules / courses taught;
- c) Coordination of teaching and/or training activities, and participation in committees on student progress/direction;
- d) The quantity and quality of seminars, regarding both tutorials and mentoring of students, including activities relating to the preparation of theses for Master's degree and PhD.
- 2. Publications will be assessed along with texts accepted for publication in accordance with regulations as well as the essays included in collective works and articles published in journals in paper or digital format, with the exception of internal notes or departmental reports. The overall consistency of the scientific production of the researcher shall be assessed, the intensity and the temporal continuity of such production, with the exception of periods of involuntary removal from the research with particular reference to parental functions such periods should be adequately documented.

The evaluation of scientific publications will be carried out on the basis of the following additional criteria:

- a) originality, innovation, methodological rigor and relevance of each publication;
- b) coherence of each publication with the specific profile of a university professor of the second level with closely related interdisciplinary subjects;
- c) scientific relevance of each journal / publisher and its impact factor within the scientific community;
- d) analytical determination, on the basis of guidelines recognized by the relevant international scientific community of the individual contribution of the researcher in the case of works carried out in partnership;
- e) in sectors where international use is consolidated, the Commission also makes use of the following indicators, with reference to the start date of the assessment:
- 1) the total number of citations;
- 2) the average number of citations per publication;
- 3) combinations of the above parameters to increase the impact of the candidate's scientific production (Hirsch index or similar).
- 3. In the assessment of the scientific research, the Commission will take account of:
- a) organisation, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups or

participation therein.

- b) participation as a speaker in national and international conferences;
- c) national and international awards for research activities;
- d) any ownership of patents.

The Commission will pay particular attention to the scientific output produced by the candidates after the date of expiry of the call under which they obtained elegibility ("Abilitazione") in order to check the continuity of their scientific production.

The Committee then asks the Personnel Office to invite the candidates to give a brief presentation of their research activities, publications and projects to help the committee deepening the knowledge of their activities and skills.

Prof. Loretoni opens the envelope containing the list of the candidates and communicate to the Committee that Prof. Michele Emdin and Prof. Claudio Passino participate to the selection and each member of the committee declares that he is not:

- a relative, or similar, to the fourth degree with the candidates (as per Art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948);
- in a situation of incompatibility with the candidates (as per articles 51 and 52 of the Code of Civil Procedure);
- in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidates (as per art. 6 bis of the Legislative Decree No 241/1990).

The Committee decides to reconvene on October 2<sup>nd</sup> 2019 at 10.00 A.M. CET in order to assess the scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the candidates and decide to submit to the Rector the request expressed by Prof. Shah to participate to the meeting via teleconference due to institutional and teaching obligations at their own universities that do not allow them to travel to Pisa.

The Committee establishes that the meeting with the two candidates will start in alphabetic order at 14.00 A.M. CET.

At the end of the meeting, the Chairperson will sign the minutes and will send them to the Personnel Office who will then make public the criteria and procedures for the assessment of publications and qualifications.

Those Committee members connected via video conference agreed to send an email to the Chairperson indicating their approval of these minutes.

The meeting was adjourned at 17.00 CET Read, approved and signed,

Lee

## THE COMMITTEE

Prof. A. Loretoni

Prof. F. Crea

Prof. P. Camici

Prof. G. Sinagra

Prof. A. Shah

Prof. J. Hill