

SELECTION OF ONE PROFESSOR (LEVEL 1 – PROFESSORE ORDINARIO), FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 12/G1 PENAL LAW – ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE IUS/17 PENAL LAW (SETTORE CONCORSUALE 12/G1 DIRITTO PENALE – SETTORE SCIENTIFICO DISCIPLINARE IUS/17 DIRITTO PENALE) AT THE DIRPOLIS INSTITUTE - ACADEMIC CLASS OF SOCIAL SCIENCES, RESERVED, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 6, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, FOR ASSOCIATE PROFESSORS AND RESEARCHERS EMPLOYED AT THE SCHOOL, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 130 DATED 12/03/2019.

MINUTES OF THE PRELIMINARY MEETING

The Review Committee for the selection of one professor (level 1) for the academic recruitment field 12/G1 Penal Law – Academic Discipline IUS/17 Penal Law at the DIRPOLIS Institute of the Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari e di Perfezionamento Sant'Anna di Pisa reserved for associate professors and researchers employed at the School to be selected pursuant to art. 24, subsection 6 of the Italian law 240/2010, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 312 dated 28/05/2019, consists of:

- Prof. Alberto di Martino, Full Professor of 12/G1 "Penal Law" at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, designated expert by the Dirpolis Institute;
- Prof. Fabio Recchia, Full Professor of 05/D1 "Physiology" at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Isidoro Blanco Cordero, Professor at the University of Alicante – Spagna;
- Prof. Ombretta Di Giovine, Full Professor of 12/G1 "Penal Law" "Diritto Penale" at the University of Foggia;
- Prof. Carloenrico Paliero, Full Professor of 12/G1 "Penal Law" at the University of Milano;
- Prof.ssa Helen Duffy, Professor at the University of Leiden.

The committee convened for the first time, via teleconference, on June 14th, 2019, at 17,15 from the following locations:

Prof. di Martino located in _Pisa____, connected via (means - address): __mail and skype (aldimartpi)_____.

Prof. Recchia located in Philadelphia, U.S.A, connected via (means - address): __skype (fabio.recchia11)_and via mail_fabio.recchia@santannapisa.it_____.

Prof. Blanco Cordero located in __Elche (Alicante)____, connected via (means - address): __mail (isidoro.blanco@ua.es)_____.

Prof. Di Giovine located in __Foggia____, connected via (means - address): _____.

Prof. Paliero located in _Milan____, connected via (means - address): __mail (carlenrico.paliero@unimi.it)_____.

Prof. Duffy located in __, U.S.A.____, connected via (means - address): __helen@rightsinpractice.org_____.

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by members of the Committee. Prof. Paliero was nominated as Chairperson and Prof. di Martino as Secretary.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that they had no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and that there were no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c.

The Committee then reviewed the call (published on the School website <https://www.santannapisa.it/it/selezioni-e-concorsi/selezioni-la-copertura-di-tre-posizioni-di-professore-di-prima-fascia-riservate>) as well as Regulations of the School that regard calls for level 1 and level 2 professors (Arts. 18 and 24 of Law 240/2010), and carried a motion that the committee's work should terminate by 28 September 2019 (*four months from the date of the nomination decree*). The Committee ascertained that Personnel Office communicated that two applications have been received.

The Committee agreed that the aim of the present meeting was to assess the criteria with which the publications the curricula and teaching activities of the candidates will be evaluated and published on the School's website.

In accordance with Italian Ministerial Decree 344/2011, the following shall be assessed: educational activities, supplementary teaching and service to students, as well as the research activities carried out by the researcher.

The Commission will assess the candidates according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification" for teaching and research required for access to didactic positions at the School¹,

¹ Teaching and Research qualification criteria, specifically requested by the Sant'Anna School (decided by Recruitment Committee and approved by the Academic Senate on 15 April 2014 and modified on 20 January 2015) :

Research Activity skills: the candidates must hold an outstanding ranking in their discipline in terms of quantity and quality of scientific publications; bibliometric criteria may be used if relevant for the scientific area.

Candidates must submit a document containing a self-assessment of their scientific productions in the international context. In this document they must explain their strength by comparison with the best-known colleagues' production and highlighting their relationships and their scientific reputation in the international research networks.

Teaching Activity skills: Teaching activity in post-graduate courses, particularly in PhD programs, is requested.

Participation in research projects: candidates are required to have been involved in research projects funded through competitive calls e.g. European ERC grants, "Framework Programs" (eg, Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, *STReP*, etc) Marie Curie actions, as well as national funding agencies. Ability in fundraising is welcome.

Publishing activity: the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations held by the candidates will be considered for the purpose of the selections.

established by the Commission for recruitment, according to the following:

1. For the assessment of teaching, supplementary teaching and service to students, the Commission will take account of:

- a) number of courses/ modules taught and continuity of teaching activities;
- b) Results of official feedback from students on the modules / courses taught;
- c) Coordination of teaching and/or training activities, and participation in committees on student progress/direction;
- d) The quantity and quality of seminars, regarding both tutorials and mentoring of students, including activities relating to the preparation of theses for Master's degree and PhD.

2. Publications will be assessed along with texts accepted for publication in accordance with regulations as well as the essays included in collective works and articles published in journals in paper or digital format, with the exception of internal notes or departmental reports. The overall consistency of the scientific production of the researcher shall be assessed, the intensity and the temporal continuity of such production, with the exception of periods of involuntary removal from the research with particular reference to parental functions - such periods should be adequately documented.

The evaluation of scientific publications will be carried out on the basis of the following additional criteria:

- a) originality, innovation, methodological rigor and relevance of each publication;
- b) coherence of each publication with the specific profile of a university professor of the second level with closely related interdisciplinary subjects;
- c) scientific relevance of each journal / publisher and its impact factor within the scientific community;
- d) analytical determination, on the basis of guidelines recognized by the relevant international scientific community of the individual contribution of the researcher in the case of works carried out in partnership;
- e) [NOT RELEVANT IN THIS CASE] in sectors where international use is consolidated, the Commission also makes use of the following indicators, with reference to the start date of the assessment:

- 1) the total number of citations;
- 2) the average number of citations per publication;
- 3) combinations of the above parameters to increase the impact of the candidate's scientific production (Hirsch index or similar).

3. In the assessment of the scientific research, the Commission will take account of:

- a) organisation, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups or participation therein.
- b) participation as a speaker in national and international conferences;
- c) national and international awards for research activities;
- d) [NOT RELEVANT IN THIS CASE] any ownership of patents.

The Commission will pay particular attention to the scientific output produced by the candidates after the date of expiry of the call under which they obtained eligibility ("Abilitazione") in order to check the continuity of their scientific production.

The Committee then establishes the criteria that it adopts for the evaluation of scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the applicants.

Research Activity skills: the candidates must hold an outstanding ranking in their discipline in terms of quantity and quality of scientific publications, with special reference to following topics: prevention and repression of public and private corruption – criminal law provisions of Italian labor law and principles of criminal liability in risky activities – corporate criminal liability – illegal markets and organised crime – gender issues and criminal law; bibliometric criteria are deemed not to be relevant for the scientific area of criminal law. The Committee will also take into consideration the self-assessment of the scientific production and reputation in international networks.

Teaching Activity skills: Teaching activity in post-graduate courses, particularly in PhD programs, is requested, with special reference to following topics: prevention and repression of public and private corruption – criminal law provisions of Italian labor law and principles of criminal liability in risky activities – corporate criminal liability – illegal markets and organised crime – gender issues and criminal law.

Participation in research projects: candidates are required to have been involved in research projects funded through competitive calls e.g. European ERC grants, "Framework Programs" (eg, Networks of Excellence, FET, Integrated Projects, *STReP*, etc) Marie Curie actions, as well as national funding agencies. Ability in fundraising is welcome (with special reference to following topics: prevention and repression of public and private corruption – criminal law provisions of Italian labor law and principles of criminal liability in risky activities – corporate criminal liability – illegal markets and organised crime – gender issues and criminal law).

Publishing activity: the roles of editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations held by the candidates will be taken into consideration.

Prof. di Martino opens the envelope containing the list of the candidates and communicate to the Committee that Prof. Gaetana MORGANTE participate to the selection and each member of the committee declares that he is not:

- a relative, or similar, to the fourth degree with the candidates (as per Art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948);
- in a situation of incompatibility with the candidates (as per articles 51 and 52 of the Code of Civil Procedure);
- in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidates (as per art. 6 bis of the Legislative Decree No 241/1990).

The Committee decides to reconvene on July 5th 2019 at 10.30 a.m. in order to assess the

scientific publications, curriculum and of teaching experience of the candidates and decide to submit to the Rector the request expressed by Prof. Paliero, Duffy, Blanco Cordero to participate to the meeting via teleconference due to institutional and teaching obligations at their own universities that do not allow them to travel to Pisa.

At the end of the meeting, the Chairperson will sign the minutes and will send them to the Personnel Office who will then make public the criteria and procedures for the assessment of publications and qualifications.

Those Committee members connected via video conference agreed to send an email to the Chairperson indicating their approval of these minutes.

The meeting was adjourned at JULY 5TH, AT 10.30 A.M.

Read, approved and signed,

THE COMMITTEE

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "C. Selini". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke at the end.