

SELECTION OF ONE PROFESSOR (LEVEL 1 – PROFESSORE ORDINARIO), FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 06/D1 CARDIOVASCULAR AND RESPIRATORY DISEASES – ACADEMIC DISCIPLINE MED/11 CARDIOVASCULAR DISEASES (SETTORE CONCORSUALE 06/D1 MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO CARDIOVASCOLARE E MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO RESPIRATORIO – SETTORE SCIENTIFICO DISCIPLINARE MED/11 MALATTIE DELL'APPARATO CARDIOVASCOLARE) AT THE LIFE SCIENCES INSTITUTE - ACADEMIC CLASS OF SPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, RESERVED, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 6, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, FOR ASSOCIATE PROFESSORS AND RESEARCHERS EMPLOYED AT THE SCHOOL, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 130 DATED 12/03/2019.

### FINAL REPORT

The year 2019, the 2nd day of the month of October at 10:00 a.m. in the Meeting room at the second floor of the building of the Scuola Sant'Anna in P.zza Martiri della Libertà, 33 , Pisa, the Committee met to review the selection process for recruitment of one full professor in the academic recruitment field 06/D1 Cardiovascular and Respiratory Diseases – Academic Discipline MED/11 Cardiovascular Diseases” at the Institute of Life Sciences of the Scuola Superiore di Studi Universitari e di Perfezionamento Sant'Anna di Pisa reserved for associate professors and researchers employed at the School to be selected pursuant to art. 24, subsection 6 of the Italian law 240/2010.

The committee had been nominated by the Rector by decree No. 312 dated 28/05/2019, consists of:

- Prof. Anna Loretoni, Full Professor of 14/A1 “Political Philosophy” at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, Member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Filippo Crea, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University Cattolica of Roma, designated expert by the Life Sciences Institute;
- Prof. Paolo Camici, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University San Raffaele of Milano;
- Prof. Gianfranco Sinagra, Full Professor of the academic discipline 06/D1 Cardiovascular and respiratory diseases at the University of Trieste;
- Prof. Shah Ajay, Full Professor at the King's College of London.
- Prof. Joseph Hill, Full Professor at the UT Southwestern.

completed its work on the following days: Preliminary meeting: on September, 11, 2019 via teleconference, Second meeting: on October, 2, 2019 , from 10 a. m. to 16.50 p.m. in Pisa (Prof. Shah Ajay was connected via Webex).

The Committee held a total of two meetings, and began its work on September, 11, 2019 and concluded it on October, 2, 2019.

In the preliminary meeting, the Committee nominated the President and Secretary. It was noted in the minutes that each member had declared that they had no kinship or affinity up to the fourth degree inclusive, either with each other or with any of the candidates: Prof. Michele Emdin and Prof. Claudio Passino. The Committee asked to Rector to postpone the deadline of their works and the Rector by



decree no. 572 dated September, 16, 2019 authorized them to conclude their work by November 28, 2019. Then the committee established the criteria for the assessment of the candidates and asked to Personnel Office to invite the two candidates to give a brief presentation of their research activities, publications and projects to help the committee deepening the knowledge of their activities and skills.

In the second meeting the Committee examined the publications, the CVs and the didactic activity of the candidates, assisted to their presentation and after a comprehensive discussion, 4 members of the committee (Proff. Camici, Crea, Sinagra, Loretoni) voted in favor of Prof. Emdin as winner of the selection. The other two members abstained because they believe that a University of this level should look for stronger candidates with an even higher international profile.

Prof. Michele Emdin was declared winner of the position.

The session closed at 16.50.

Read, approved and signed.

THE COMMITTEE

- Prof. Filippo Crea, President
- Prof. Anna Loretoni, Member
- Prof. Joseph Hill, Member
- Prof. Paolo Camici, Member
- Prof. Gianfranco Sinagra, Secretary

The image shows five handwritten signatures. The first two are in blue ink and correspond to Prof. Filippo Crea and Prof. Anna Loretoni. The next two are in black ink and correspond to Prof. Joseph Hill and Prof. Paolo Camici. The final signature is a simple horizontal line in black ink, corresponding to Prof. Gianfranco Sinagra.

## ANNEX 1 – INDIVIDUAL ASSESSMENTS

Prof. Camici

Both candidates have a good scientific track record although Prof. Emdin has a higher H-Index and Total Impact Factor. In addition this member of the committee thinks that Prof. Emdin has more clinical and managerial skills compared to prof. Passino.

Prof. Crea

Both candidates show an excellent CV with large teaching, research and clinical experience. Both candidates have similar experience in the organization, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups.

Prof. Emdin exhibits a more robust teaching activity and higher bibliometric indexes.

Prof. Hill

We conducted a comprehensive evaluation of the two candidates, including analysis of their research activities, publications, and funding, as well as their teaching activities. Both candidates have clear strengths. That said, to the extent that the university seeks to elevate its international profile, I believe consideration should be given to recruiting stronger candidates with more robust profiles of research.

Prof. Shah

After careful consideration of the candidates' CVs and track record, my view was that a University of this reputation and standing should consider stronger candidates for this important position, perhaps through a call open to external candidates.

Prof. Sinagra

Both candidates have a good number of high scientific publications although Prof. Emdin has a higher H-Index and Total IF.

Prof. Emdin has more evidence of high quality clinical work and teaching activities dedication, compared to Prof. Passino and has more managerial duties.

Four handwritten signatures in blue ink, arranged horizontally from left to right. The first signature is a stylized, somewhat abstract scribble. The second signature is a cursive 'R' followed by a horizontal line. The third signature is a cursive 'W'. The fourth signature is a cursive 'A' followed by a vertical line.

## ANNEX 2 – COLLEGIATE ASSESSMENT

In relation to the presented titles the Committee highlights what follows.

Number of courses/ modules taught and continuity of teaching activities

Both candidates exhibit teaching experience to undergraduate students and in PhD programmes and Masters. Prof. Emdin also has teaching experience in postgraduate courses. Overall Prof. Emdin is more experienced.

Results of official feedback from students on the modules / courses taught

The scoring (year 2017/2018) for Prof. Emdin was positive for 100% of students while was positive for Prof. Passino for 80% of students. However this scores were given by 7 and 45 students only, respectively. It is therefore difficult to interpret the results.

Coordination of teaching and/or training activities, and participation in committees on student progress/direction

Prof. Emdin is coordinator of a second level Master while Prof. Passino is coordinator of 3 second level Masters and of 1 PhD course. Overall Prof. Passino shows larger experience.

The quantity and quality of seminars, regarding both tutorials and mentoring of students, including activities relating to the preparation of theses for Master's degree and PhD

Prof. Emdin has been tutor of more than 70 thesis since 1990 of undergraduate students and of 6 PhD students while Prof. Passino has been tutor of 12 thesis for undergraduate students and of 6 PhD students. Prof. Emdin is more experienced.

Originality, innovation, methodological rigor and relevance of each publication.

Both candidates present a large number of relevant and original publications.

Coherence of each publication with the specific profile of a university professor of the second level with closely related interdisciplinary subjects

For both candidates publications are coherent with the specific profile of a university professor of the second level with closely related interdisciplinary subjects.



Scientific relevance of each journal / publisher and its impact factor within the scientific community

Prof. Emdin has more publications in Q1 Journals than Prof. Passino among the 20 presented by each candidate. Prof. Emdin performs better.

Analytical determination, on the basis of guidelines recognized by the relevant international scientific community, of the individual contribution of the researcher in the case of works carried out in partnership

Prof. Emdin is first or last author in a larger number of publications than Prof. Passino among the 20 publications presented by each candidate.

The total number of citations

The total number of citation is higher for Prof. Emdin than for Prof. Passino.

The average number of citations per publication

The average number of citations is higher for Prof. Passino.

Combinations of the above parameters to increase the impact of the candidate's scientific production (Hirsch index or similar).

The H-index is higher for Prof. Emdin than for Prof. Passino by a tiny margin.

Organisation, leadership and coordination in national and international research groups or participation therein

Prof. Emdin and Prof. Passino exhibit a similar experience in the coordination of national and international funded competitive research projects, typically as local PI.

Participation as a speaker in national and international conferences

Both candidates have been speakers in a large number of international meetings.

National and international awards for research activities

None of the two candidates has received awards.

Ownership of patents

Prof. Emdin is the owner of 2 patents while Prof. Passino does not exhibit any patent.

The image shows several handwritten signatures. On the left, there is a large, complex signature in black ink. To its right, the name 'Emdin' is written in a cursive script in black ink. Further right, there are two smaller, more stylized signatures in blue ink.