SELECTION OF ONE ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 07/B1 "AGRONOMY AND FIELD, VEGETABLE, ORNAMENTAL CROPPING SYSTEMS AT THE LIFE SCIENCES INSTITUTE" AT THE INSTITUTE OF LIFE SCIENCES - ACADEMIC CLASS OF EXPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 5, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 198 DATED 04/04/2019.

The Committee for the evaluation of Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini, tenure-track — probationary, assistant professor, in third year of his temporary contract pursuant to Italian Law no. 240/2010, art. 24 paragraph 3 letter B, in order to promote him to Associate Professor in the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems" at the Institute of Life Sciences, nominated by the Rector by decree No. 292 dated 21/05/2019, consists of:

- Prof.ssa Laura Ercoli, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems" at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna (School), designated expert by the Institute of Life Sciences;
- Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 13/B2 "Management"
  at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna (School), member of the Recruitment Committee;
- Prof. Salvatore Cosentino, Professor of the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems" at the University of Catania,
- Prof. Reinhart J. Ceulemans, Professor at the University of Antwerpen;
- Prof.ssa Solange I. Mussatto, Professor at the Danmarks Tekniske Universitet:
- Prof. Michael B. Jones Professor Emeritus at the Trinity College Dublin.

The Committee convened on 25 June 2019 at 11:00 AM. Prof. Salvatore Cosentino, Prof.ssa Laura Ercoli, Prof. Reinhart Ceulemans and Prof.ssa Solange I. Mussatto were in Sala CdA Palazzo Toscanelli of the Scuola; Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti and Prof. Michael B. Jones participated to the meeting via teleconference, from the following locations:

- Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti located in Roma, connected via Skype turchetti giuseppe
- Prof. Michael B. Jones located in Dublin, connected via Skype mike.jones322.

The draft of the minutes that follows, was agreed on and approved by all the members of the Committee.

Pursuant to art. 5 paragraph 2 of Legislative Decree no. 1172/1948, each member declared that he/she has no kinship or affinity up to the fourth grade with any of the other members and the candidate, that there are no reasons for abstention in relation to art. 51 of c.p.c. and that he/she



is not in any situation, actual or potential, of conflict of interests with the candidate (as per art. 6 bis of the Legislative Decree No 241/1990).

Prof. Salvatore Cosentino was nominated as President and Prof.ssa Laura Ercoli as Secretary.

The Committee then reviewed the Call and especially his article 4 and agreed that the candidate shall be assessed according to the parameters established by Ministerial Decree 344/2011, in relation to the compliance of the scientific profile with the "general criteria of qualification for teaching and research required for access to professoral positions at the School" established by the School's Commission for Recruitment and set out in article 1 of the Call.

The members of the Committee stated that the Personnel Office of the School has provided them with an electronic copy of the documentation submitted by the candidate containing: application, curriculum, publications with a declaration in lieu of an affidavit certifying compliance with the original, and a list of all the documents accompanying the application and that they have examined it and made their individual assessments, which are reported in Annex 1 of these minutes.

The Committee then collectively examined the publications, curriculum and teaching activities of the candidate, confronted their individual assessments and reviewed the collegiate assessment annexes sub 2 attached to the minutes of which it is an integral part.

Then after a full discussion, the Committee declared, unanimously, that Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini is not qualified to be appointed as associate professor.

Prof. Turchetti (Member of the Recruitment Committee) testified that the evaluation of the candidate, the presentation of the individual assessments, the ensuing discussion and, in general, the whole procedure occurred in full compliance with the rules established by Scuola Sant'Anna and its recruitment committee.

Given the conclusion of the selection procedure for a position of associate professor, at the Institute of Life Sciences in the Academic Class of Experimental and Applied Sciences, for the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems", pursuant to art. 24, subsection 5 of Italian law 240/2010, the President declared the work closed.

These minutes, drawn up and signed by the President and the attached declarations of the Committee's members will be sent the Personnel Office in order for these proceedings to be verified, with a decree by the Rector.

The session closed at 16:00 PM.

2 2 2 D

Read, approved and signed,

The President

Prof. Salvatore Cosentino

The Secretary

Cong ay

Prof.ssa Laura Ercoli

Prof.ssa Solange I. Mussatto

Prof. Reinhart J. Ceulemans

# Annex 1

Evaluation Giorgio Ragaglini

# Overall assessment

#### Career

Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini (GR) has a long research activity, starting from the Master degree in 2002. He was a PhD student in the period 2002-2006, had a post-doc fellowship in 2006-2008, was Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract (type a) in 2008-2014, post-doc in 2014-2016 and Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract (type b) from 1/8/2016 to 1/8/2019. In 2017 GR obtained the National Scientific Habilitation as Associate Professor in Agronomy and Field Crops (AGR/02).

#### Research

GR has a good research record in terms of research projects that he has participated in since he obtained his PhD in 2006. He has developed a number of related themes and has been involved in collaboration in two interuniversity research centres. The two related areas that he appears to be developing are "Biomass, Energy Crops and Bioenergy" and "Climate Change and Sustainable Exploitation of Resources". These are two areas that are currently very active and the opportunities for the future would appear to be positive if GR can tap into funding opportunities which are currently available, particularly in EU research programmes. However most of the research collaboration so far has been in Italy and the evaluation committee would have hoped to see more evidence of international collaboration.

The publication record of GR is reasonable for his current position but by international standards the evaluation committee would judge it as being average to low. The publications are in relatively high impact factor journals but citations are not strong. The evaluation committee would have hoped to see a stronger trajectory in research outputs at this stage of his career. At the date of 20 June 2019, the number of publications from the Scopus database is 23 (2 publications as first author, 7 as last author) and 14 publications are published on journals ranked in Scimago Q1. He obtained 323 citations for his work and has H-index equal to 10. The number of publications (overall and per year), however, is low and over the last two years the quantity of publications is below what is acceptable for a senior researcher or assistant professor. It is a little bit alarming that the number of publications over the last two years has been very low, although the candidate has established his own team (he declares 5 post-docs, 2 Ph.D. students and 3 technicians). The 12 selected publications are innovative and novel but the total amount of citations is not above average (259).

### **Teaching**

GR has a quite limited experience of teaching, as he has taught one course (Biomass and Bioenergy) in the last three academic years (2016-2019) to undergraduate students of the University of Pisa. No mention is made about teaching activity at post-graduate level, besides tutoring of 2 PhD students. It is not possible to evaluate the quality of the teaching activities, as no evidence of teaching performance in terms of student evaluation was provided. According to these criteria also the teaching profile of the candidate is weak.

Leta d

Based on the above the evaluation committee unanimously considers that GR is still progressing in his academic career, but his present qualifications do not make him eligible for a position as Associate Professor at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna.

#### Individual evaluations

## Prof. Reinhart CEULEMANS

The publications have been published in international, scientific journals with peer review board, several of them with high impact factors in the discipline. Most of the publications are original and innovative, but their total number of citations is not exceptionally high. The publication with the highest number of citations (80) dates back to 2010 (Nassi O Di Nasso et al., GCB-B) but the role of Giorgio Ragaglini in this publication is not clear and has not been specified. The majority of the publications appeared in the highest (Q1) percentile of the scientific journals in the field. The number of publications (overall and per year), however, is low and over the last two years the quantity of publications is below what is acceptable for a senior researcher or assistant professor. It is a little bit alarming that the number of publications over the last two years has been very low, although the candidate has established his own team (with 5 post-docs, 2 Ph.D. students and 3 technicians).

The total number of citations, the average number of citations per publication and the Hirsch index of the candidate are average to good, but neither outstanding nor excellent. A main weakness of the publications is that none – or very few – of them incorporate international collaboration or international co-authors; nearly all publications include only co-authors from Pisa and/or from a few other institutes in Italy. Overall, the international dimension of the curriculum of the candidate is weak: no proofs of international research network, no international research stay abroad, no international co-authors.

Overall, the teaching load of the candidate is low (only 3 CFU or ECTS), but the selection committee had no access to formal feedback from students on the courses taught. The candidate has been involved in a number of committees on student progress and direction. So far, there have been no successful doctoral degrees produced under the supervision of the candidate, although two Ph.D.'s are currently in progress.

The candidate has acquired a number of research grants, few as coordinator and several as participant or co-investigator. It is, however, not clear to the selection committee which projects were individually acquired by the candidate or what his role was in the obtained projects (several projects seemed to have been acquired under the supervision or coordination of Prof. E. Bonari). Overall, the total amount of funding acquired by the candidate is not exceptionally high. The selection committee regrets that the candidate has not applied to a European ERC grant, which would be a sign of an outstanding researcher.

### Prof. Laura Ercoli

#### Research activity

The scientific production mainly focuses on production of biomass crops and bio/chemical process technologies for the production of energy from biomass. The performance of the candidate in terms of scientific production is good, but shows a remarkable discontinuity over time. From the Scopus database, production of publications started in 2010, was low until 2013 (0.75 papers per year, two papers in Q1 and one in Q2), highly increased from 2014 to 2017 (4.5 papers per year, 12 in Q1, 5 in Q2 and 1 in Q3) and decreased again in 2018 and 2019 (one paper per year, one in Q4 and one in Q1). Therefore, there is an evidence of declining research activity in the last two years.

4 M & &

At the date of 20th June 2019, the number of publications from the Scopus database is 23 (2 publications as first author, 7 as last author) and 14 publications are published on journals ranked in Scimago Q1. He obtained 323 citations for his work and has H-index equal to 10.

If we consider the relatively long research career (from 2006 - PhD achievement - up to 2019), both the scientific production and the citation received do not appear to be outstanding.

The scientific collaborations and the international connections are not convincingly demonstrated; this could be a weak point of the candidate.

## Teaching activity

GR has a quite limited experience of teaching, as he has taught one course (Biomass and bioenergy) in three academic years to undergraduate students of the University of Pisa. No mention is made about teaching activity at post-graduate level, besides tutoring of 2 PhD students. It is not possible to evaluate the quality of the teaching activities, as no evidence of teaching performance in terms of student evaluation was provided.

# Research projects

GR has shown an intense research activity, displayed by the involvement in many funded research projects. In detail, in the period 2015-2019, he has participated to 11 competitive research projects. The total budget of competitive projects was not specified, since the total budget reported by the candidate includes five non-competitive projects. These results highlight a very good capacity to attract funds.

### **Editorial activities**

From the CV is not possible to know whether GR is involved in the editorial board of scientific journals or plays leadership role in scientific societies. It is also unknown whether he has served as reviewer for both national and international scientific journals and research projects.

## Prof. Mike Jones

Dr Ragaglini has an impressive research record in terms of research projects that he has participated in since he obtained his PhD in 2006. He has developed a number of related themes and has been involved in collaboration in two interuniversity research centres. The two related areas that he appears to be developing are Biomass, Energy Crops and Bioenergy and Climate change and sustainable exploitation of resources. These are two areas that are currently very active and the opportunities for the future would appear to be positive if he can tap into funding opportunities which are currently available, particularly in EU research programmes. However most of the research collaboration so far has been in Italy and I would have hoped to see more evidence of international collaboration. The publication record of Dr. Ragaglini is reasonable for his current position but by international standards I would judge it as being average to low. The publications are in relatively high impact factor journals but citations are not strong. I would have hoped to see a stronger trajectory in research outputs at this stage of his career.

As to other contributions to the academic community in teaching and administration, we are presented with very little detail so it is difficult to comment. However my impression is that his contribution to teaching while being very relevant is rather limited. However I am not clear on the expected contribution expected in Italian institutions at this stage of his career. Also I am not clear what is expected in terms of other contribution to the institutions but there is no evidence involvement in teaching or research committees which we would expect in my own institution.

Em & D

In summary I would suggest that the candidate overall is close to qualifying for progression to the next stage but does not present a particularly strong case.

## Prof. Solange Mussatto

### Assessment of the candidate

Dr. Ragaglini has developed his research career at the University of Pisa. As demonstrated in his CV, his scientific trajectory is basically supported by collaboration with Italian partners, especially working in the same research group. International collaboration is not a strong point in his career up till now.

One point of concern is the number of publications. Although he has some papers published in good journals in the area, the total number of publications is low for an Associate Professor candidate (only 23 in Scopus, June 20th, 2019). Special attention is given to the reduced number of publications in the last five years, which is in fact strange considering that he has been involved in several projects. In addition, only one patent is reported, which indicates that the low publication record is not due to a problem of patent protection or confidentiality. The total number of citations and H index (10) are also low, suggesting a modest impact of the candidate scientific production.

About project coordination, Dr. Ragaglini has been coordinator of 2 projects, attracting a total budget of approx. 41000 EUR. He reports involvement in several other projects but his role/obligations in these projects are not very clear. Leadership and ability to attract funding is not strong as reported in his CV and this is a very important aspect to be considered for an Associate Professor.

Experience in the supervision of students until now is also modest. Currently supervising 2 PhDs (still not finished) and few MSc. He has been involved in some teaching activities at the MSc level, which is important for a career of professor, but with just few hours per year ("Biomass and Bioenergy" (30 h) and "Cropping systems" (10 h). Feedback from the students was not available for consideration. He has some participation in committees which demonstrates his interest to participate in commissions to support teaching/research.

Overall, I conclude that Dr. Ragaglini is still progressing in his career but at this moment does not present qualification enough to be promoted to a position of Associate Professor.

### Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti

Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini got his Master degree in 2002 and his PhD In 2006. He had a post-doc fellowship in 2006-2008, was Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract (type A) in 2008-2014, post-doc in 2014-2016 and Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract (type B) from 1/8/2016 to 1/8/2019.

In 2017 the Candidate obtained the National Scientific Habilitation as Associate Professor in Agronomy and Field Crops (AGR/02).

The scientific production mainly focuses on production of biomass crops and bio/chemical process technologies for the production of energy from biomass.

The performance of the candidate in terms of scientific production is good, but shows discontinuity over time. From the Scopus database, production of publications started in 2010 was low until 2013, increased from 2014 to 2017, and decreased again in 2018 and 2019, with only one publication per year indexed on Scopus.

At the date of 20th June 2019, the number of publications from the Scopus database is 23 (2 publications as first author, 7 as last author) and 14 publications are published on journals ranked in Scimago Q1. He obtained 323 citations for his work and has h-index equal to 10. The candidate has a

E ~ 2 4

scientific performance that, overall (as it is not constant), is comparable with the average scores of the Italian Associate Professors of the scientific sector AGR/02.

The candidate does not have an extensive teaching experience, as he has taught the course on Biomass and bioenergy (30 hours) in three academic years (2016/17, 2017/18, 2018/19) and the course on Cropping Systems (10 hours, academic year 2018/19) to undergraduate students of the University of Pisa. No mention is made about teaching activity at post-graduate level. No evidence of teaching performance based on students' evaluation was provided.

Dr. Ragaglini has shown an intense research activity, displayed by the involvement in many funded research projects. In detail, he has coordinated/been involved in research projects funded by the European Commission, by public and private national institutions. Dr. Ragaglini's career is not characterized by a relevant activity of coordination and participation in international research groups. From the CV it is not possible to know whether Dr. Ragaglini is involved in the editorial board of scientific journals and scientific societies, or if he has served as reviewer for both scientific journals and research projects.

Starting from 2016, Dr. Ragaglini has participated to committees both at the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna and at two Interuniversity research centers (CRIBE and CIRTA), and supervised/cosupervised three PhD students and five post-doctoral students, and two MSc theses. He is owner of a patent and co-founder of a spin-off company of the Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna (Tellus srl).

In conclusion, Dr. Ragaglini, even if not always continuous in his scientific productivity, has the profile of a good scholar, substantially in line with the average of the associate professors in Agronomy and Field Crops (AGR/02), without being outstanding.

## Prof. Salvatore Cosentino

The candidate Giorgio Ragaglini born in Carrara (MS) on 16/01/1977, is an Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract for the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field Crops" according to the italian law 240/10 B type from 1/8/2016 at the "Istituto di Scienze della Vita della Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna di Pisa" working mainly in the field of Biomass crops and related topics.

#### Career

The candidate graduated at the Faculty of Agricultural Science of the University of Pisa, was awarded for a PhD position in "Agriculture and Environment" at Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna. In 2006, and continued his activity at the same Institution as a postdoctoral position, as Assistant Professor at the Institute of Life Sciences of Scuola Superiore Sant'Anna, as postdoctoral researcher and, from 2016 to 2018 as Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract for the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field Crops". He obtained National Scientific Habilitation to a position of Associate Professor in 2017.

# **Teaching activity**

The candidate has carried out the course in BIOMASS and BIOENERGY in three following years at the Master degree in Biotechnology. He also carried out the subject CROPPING SISTEMS in another Master. He has carried out of supplementary teaching and service to students, as well as the tutorial and mentoring of students.

The evaluation of the students on the courses are not public and were not included by the candidate therefore was not possible to evaluate his impact to the students.

He has been in the 2 Didactics Committee of the degree Courses and he was part of the PhD Committees in PhD in Agrobiosciences and PhD in Agrobiodiversity. He was also in PhD examination

E ~ 9 6

Committees. The candidate has addressed a seminar, conducted student assistant for three years. He is supervisor of two PhD students, he was Post PhD tutor of 8 students and 5 PhD students. He was also supervising 2 master thesis and reviewer of 2 master thesis.

Taking into consideration above reported teaching activity of the candidate Giorgio Ragaglini, while he showed a good teaching activity it was not possible to evaluate is impact on students as students' judgments was not included. Moreover, teaching activity in PhD courses is also missing.

## Research activity

Previously of being Assistant Professor with a fixed-term employment contract for the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field Crops" he had five contracts with private companies and participated to 13 national groups and 5 international groups

From 2008 to present, he was involved in several research activities mainly dealing with the sustainable production of energy and fuels from energy crops. However, in this period, he had the opportunity to focus his interest also on other topics, such as Integrated Pest Management, Precision farming & remote sensing, Agroforestry and mixed farming systems, Climate change & sustainable exploitation of resources,

He collaborated to the development of the Inter-University Research Centre on Energy Biomass (CRIBE) and to the training of part of the people within his research team, currently composed by 5 postdoctoral researchers, 2 PhD students and supported by 3 technicians. From 2008 to present, he was the scientific responsible of two European Projects (1 UE FP7 and 1 LIFE, the latter started in 2018), nine National projects (1 as CRIBE-SSSA), of which five still in course, and nine collaborations with private companies. From 2011 to present, as scientific responsible, he contributed to an overall net intake equal to 1,786,338.87 €, 48% and 39% of which as external funding from competitive European and National founding programs, respectively, and 9% as collaboration with private companies.

In the SciVal topic T.2675, which refers to perennial energy grasses, for the period 2013-2018 was ranked 80th in the list of top 500 authors in terms of Scholarly Outputs, and the 67% of my publications are in the 10% Top Journal Percentile of the topic. In the same reference period, was ranked 6th among the 26 authors working in Italian institutions listed in this category.

The candidate has coordinated an international contract project (NETAFIM) and a national contract project (TENERIS DALMINE). He is local responsible of the European Life 2014-2020 project AGRESTIC from 2018-2023. He is responsible of the Local Unit of 5 Tuscany Regional projects of 16.2 rural measure and 1 Tuscany regional project of 16.1 rural measure. He is also unit responsible for a local project of the Cooperative ACLI and participate to other three Tuscany Regional projects of 16.2 rural measure.

He participated to an Italian PATENT F1.S00061.12.IT.1 on "Photobiological production of polyhydroxybutirate from biomass with non-sulfur red bacteria".

With reference to the research projects he showed a good participation to many projects showing also a good capacity of fund raising. However, he does not show a wide international networking in research. Indeed, many of the projects are at regional level and private contracts.

### **Publications**

The candidate presented 12 publications fully consistent with the Academic recruitment sector of Field Crops and Agronomy. The individual contribution in the collaborative works is good as the candidate is the first author in 2 works, the last author in 5 works and corresponding author in 1 work. Its contribution is clearly significant considering the skills derived from the CV and the nature of the topics of the publications. All the works presented are characterized by good originality, appropriate methodological rigor and high innovation. The editorial placement of the publications presented is

te M & 6 A

excellent: 11 publications are in Q1, 1 in Q2 (Italian Journal of Agronomy) according to the science category of on SCOPUS. All 12 publications submitted by the Candidate are indexed ISI/Scopus. Scientific production shows good continuity. However, the works presented were produced over a 8-year period (2010-2017), while no paper are presented for the last two years. As a matter of fact, he published only one paper in 2018 and one paper in 2019 which are not valuable as a continuity. The candidate does not show to be editor and associate editor of scientific journals, editor of book

The quality of the 12 papers submitted is excellent from 2010 to 2017, however no paper is presented for the last two years. As a matter of fact, he published only one paper in 2018 and one paper in 2019 which are not strictly in the recruitment area agronomy and field crops and valuable as a continuity.

series and other publishing activities or leadership roles in scientific associations.

E M

SELECTION OF ONE ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 07/B1 "AGRONOMY AND FIELD, VEGETABLE, ORNAMENTAL CROPPING SYSTEMS AT THE LIFE SCIENCES INSTITUTE" AT THE INSTITUTE OF LIFE SCIENCES - ACADEMIC CLASS OF EXPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 5, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 198 DATED 04/04/2019.

#### DECLARATION

I, the undersigned Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti, declare to have attended via teleconference the meeting for the evaluation of Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini, tenure-track – probationary, assistant professor, in third year of his temporary contract pursuant to Italian Law no. 240/2010, art. 24 paragraph 3 letter B, in order to promote him to Associate Professor in the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems" at the Institute of Life Sciences and to agree with the present minutes signed by the President.

25 giugno 2019

The Declarant

Prof. Giuseppe Turchetti

SELECTION OF ONE ASSOCIATE PROFESSOR FOR THE ACADEMIC RECRUITMENT FIELD 07/B1 "AGRONOMY AND FIELD, VEGETABLE, ORNAMENTAL CROPPING SYSTEMS AT THE LIFE SCIENCES INSTITUTE" AT THE INSTITUTE OF LIFE SCIENCES - ACADEMIC CLASS OF EXPERIMENTAL AND APPLIED SCIENCES, PURSUANT TO ART. 24, SUBSECTION 5, OF ITALIAN LAW 240/2010, ISSUED BY RECTOR DECREE NO. 198 DATED 04/04/2019.

#### DECLARATION

I, the undersigned PMB INVES, declare to have attended via teleconference the meeting for the evaluation of Dr. Giorgio Ragaglini, tenure-track – probationary, assistant professor, in third year of his temporary contract pursuant to Italian Law no. 240/2010, art. 24 paragraph 3 letter B, in order to promote him to Associate Professor in the Academic Recruitment Field 07/B1 "Agronomy and Field, Vegetable, Ornamental Cropping Systems" at the Institute of Life Sciences and to agree with the present minutes signed by the President.

Place and date

The Declarant

Prof. VVCA DIT

Dubliny 25/6/19